

Board Office Use: Legislative File Info.	
File ID Number	25-0711
Introduction Date	
Enactment Number	
Enactment Date	



**OAKLAND UNIFIED
SCHOOL DISTRICT**
Community Schools, Thriving Students

Board Cover Memorandum

To Board of Education

From Kyla Johnson-Trammell, Superintendent
Sondra Aguilera, Chief Academic Officer
Nicole Knight, Executive Director of ELLMA
Julie Kessler, Director of Newcomer and ELL Programs

Meeting Date April 23, 2025

Subject Curriculum Adoption for Designated English Language Development 1-4

Ask of the Board Adoption by the Board of Education of Resolution No.2425-0212 Selection and purchase of the following curricular materials: *National Geographic LIFT course materials* for DELD 1-4;
ELD 1 - Lift Welcome
ELD 2 - Lift Intro
ELD 3 - Lift Fundamentals
ELD 4 - Lift 1

Background **Need for Updated ELD 1-4 Curriculum**
Providing teachers and students equitable access to high-quality, standards-based instructional materials is a responsibility of the school district and a central component of OUSD's strategy to build coherent instructional systems that improve student outcomes, particularly for students from marginalized communities. To meet the strategic plan goal of guaranteeing literacy by 3rd grade and beyond, OUSD has adopted and implemented high-quality materials in elementary, middle, and high school in recent years. Providing this curriculum with aligned professional development and coaching has created greater alignment across schools and access to grade-level, standards-based learning.

Newcomer ELD teachers across OUSD have been using the *National Geographic* curriculum, which has been the *Inside* textbooks for middle school and the *Edge* textbooks for middle school. However, these textbooks are being discontinued and are no longer being printed, and will no longer be available to order in the next few years. For this reason, the ELLMA Office decided to investigate other curriculum options for secondary newcomer ELD, in addition to the new textbooks from *National Geographic*. After surveying neighboring and similar districts who serve similar populations of newcomers, ELLMA learned that the *Vista* curriculum is another popular choice and warranted further investigation. For this reason, we landed on piloting the new curriculum in *National Geographic (Lift)* along with *Vista*. Updating these instructional resources is essential to support teachers and ensure all students are receiving high quality curriculum and instruction.

Discussion

Selection Process

In collaboration with middle and high school ELD teachers, the ELLMA team reviewed materials from two publishers. Starting in spring 2024, the team evaluated print and online resources using criteria informed by student and teacher feedback, as well as expert curriculum reviews, and consultation with other high count newcomer districts across the state to identify the best fit for rigorous and relevant ELD instruction across OUSD.

In fall 2024, the committee recommended piloting both the National Geographic and Vista ELD series books

Twelve teachers from two high schools and 5 middle schools participated in the pilot during the 24-25 school year, using the materials during their scheduled ELD courses.

In February 2025, the teachers completed the pilot, evaluating the materials for student access, student talk, writing expression, complex text use, rigor, cultural relevance, scaffolding for students and teacher support

Fiscal Impact

The funding for the cost of instructional materials and professional learning will be from LCFF Supplemental & Concentration Carryover and annually from CA State Lottery Funds. The total cost for the purchase of curriculum and the associated professional learning, illustrated below, is \$569,541.15 over three years. The service agreement to National Geographic will be \$532,101.15 and the cost for OUSD to provide professional learning will be \$37,440.00.

Attachments

- Board Memo
- Resolution
- Presentation

Summary of 2025-2028 Instructional Materials Cost

Year	Summary of Materials to be Purchased	Quantity	Costs
2025-2028	National Geographic Lift Welcome: Student's Book TBD 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2025] 9798214172347 / 8214172349	600 per year X 3 years	\$24,000.00 x 3 years \$72,000
2025-2028	National Geographic Lift Welcome: Teacher's Book TBD 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2025] 9798214172378 / 8214172373	16 per year X 3 years	Free
2025-2028	National Geographic LIFT AME WELCOME SPARK TEACHER S ACCESS EPIN (12 MO) Lesaux/ Short 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2025] 9798214385211 / 8214385210	16 per year X 3 years	Free
2025-2028	National Geographic Lift Intro: Teacher's Book TBD 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2025] 9798214172484 / 8214172489	16 per year X 3 years	Free
2025-2028	National Geographic LIFT AME INTRO SPARK TEACHERS ACCESS EPIN (12 MO) Lesaux/ Short 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2025] 9798214385228 / 8214385229	16 per year X 3 years	Free
2025-2028	National Geographic Lift Intro: Student's Book TBD 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2025] 9798214172453 / 8214172454	763 per year X 3 years	\$55,699.00 x 3 years \$167,097
2025-2028	National Geographic Lift Intro: Language Companion TBD 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2025] 9798214172538 / 8214172535	763 per year X 3 years	\$22,890.00 x 3 years \$68,670
2025-2028	National Geographic Lift Fundamentals: Teacher's Book Tbd 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2023] 9780357501245 / 0357501241	16 per year X 3 years	Free
2025-2028	National Geographic Lift Fundamentals: Language Companion Tbd 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2023] 9780357501207 / 0357501209	444 per year X 3 years	\$13,320.00 x 3 years \$39,960.00
2025-2028	National Geographic Lift Fundamentals: Student's Book Tbd 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2023] 9780357501122 / 0357501128	444 per year X 3 years	\$32,412.00 x 3 years \$97,236.00
2025-2028	National Geographic LIFT AME OLP/EBK TEACHER ACCES S EPIN FUNDAMENTALS (12 MO) Adams/Worthington/Lesaux 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2023] 9798214172927 / 8214172926	16 per year X 3 years	Free
2025-2028	National Geographic Lift 1: Teacher's Book Tbd 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2023] 9780357501252 / 035750125X	16 per year X 3 years	Free
2025-2028	National Geographic Lift 1: Student's Book Tbd 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2023] 9780357501139 / 0357501136	200 per year X 3 years	\$14,600.00 x 3 years

			\$43,800
2025-2028	National Geographic Lift 1: Language Companion Tbd 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2023] 9780357501214 / 0357501217	200 per year X 3 years	\$6,000.00 x 3 years \$18,000.00
2025-2028	National Geographic LIFT AME OLP/EBK TEACHER ACCESS EPIN 1 16 (12 MO) Adams/Worthington/Lesaux 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2023] 9798214172934 / 8214172934	16 per year X 3 years	Free
2025-2028	National Geographic Lift Phonics: Teacher's Book NGL 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2025] 9798214457963 / 8214457963	16 per year X 3 years	Free
2025-2028	Processing Fees		\$8,446.05 per year X 3 years \$25,338.15
Total			\$532,101.15

3 Year Professional Learning Costs

Year	Summary of trainings	Quantity	Costs
2025-2028	ELL PRODUCT TRAINING National Geographic Learning 1st Edition [CENGAGE ELT, 2023] 9798214457833 / 8214457831	2	Free
2025-2028	Teacher hours for training		\$37,440 16 Newcomer ELD Teachers \$60 a hour 6.5 hours a day X 2 days X 3 years
Total			\$37,440

Legislative File Info.	
File ID Number:	25-0711
Introduction Date:	
Enactment Number:	
Enactment Date:	

**RESOLUTION
OF THE
BOARD OF EDUCATION
OF THE
OAKLAND UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT
NO. 2425-0212**

Secondary Designated English Language Development Levels 1-4

WHEREAS, pursuant to Board Policy 6161.1, the Governing Board is responsible for selecting textbooks and other instructional materials for use in District schools;

WHEREAS, the State Board of Education (SBE) has approved standards for curriculum, certain curriculum frameworks, and has approved a list of basic instructional materials for use in secondary designated ELD

WHEREAS, the Governing Board shall select instructional materials or shall have otherwise determined which instructional materials align with the state academic content standards;

WHEREAS, the Governing Board shall select instructional materials for secondary Designated English Language Development upon determining that the materials are:

- Aligned to applicable academic content standards;
- Are provided by publishers that comply with legal requirements;
- Do not reflect adversely upon persons because of their race or ethnicity, gender, religion, disability, nationality, sexual orientation, occupation, or other characteristic listed in Education Code 220, nor contain any sectarian or denominational doctrine or propaganda contrary to law;
- Reflective of California's multicultural society, avoid stereotyping, and contribute to a positive learning environment;
- Are accurate, objective, current , and suited to the needs and comprehension of district students at their respective grade levels;
- With the exception of literature and trade books, use proper grammar and spelling;
- Do not expose students to a commercial brand name, product, or corporate or company logo unless the Board makes a specific finding that the use is appropriate;
- Support the district's adopted courses of study and curricular goals;
- Contribute to a comprehensive, balanced curriculum;
- Provide for a wide range of materials at all levels of difficulty, with appeal to students of varied

interests, abilities and developmental levels;

- Include materials that stimulate discussion of contemporary issues and improve students' thinking and decision-making skills;
- Contribute to the proper articulation of instruction through grade levels;
- Have corresponding versions available in languages other than English as appropriate; ● Include high-quality teacher's guides;
- Meet high publishing standards in terms of the quality, durability and appearance of paper, binding, text and graphics;
- Upon adoption of standards by the SBE, not exceed maximum textbook weight standards;
- Meet the standards for social content that portray in a realistic manner democratic values, cultural pluralism, and the diversity of the state's population, and emphasize people in varied, positive, and contributing roles;

WHEREAS, as summarized in Attachments, instructional review committees comprised of teachers, teachers on special assignment and district content specialists, with the majority of the participants being classroom teachers, reviewed instructional materials for potential use in District schools and found the following to meet the standards for adoption, therefore, the following instructional materials are recommended for adoption by the Governing Board:

- National Geographic LIFT Series for secondary Designated English Language Development

WHEREAS, expenditures, pursuant to an agreement between National Geographic for secondary Designated English Language Development. This shall not exceed the total amount of \$532,101.15, for the period June, 2025 to June 30th, 2028, for the purchase of 6-12 grades Designated English Language Development 1-4. thereto;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Board of Education hereby finds that National Geographic LIFT instructional materials meet the standards for adoption and hereby selects National Geographic for secondary Designated English Language Development for use in district schools.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Board approves the Services Agreement by and between the District and National Geographic for secondary Designated English Language Development. This shall not exceed the total amount of \$532,101.15, for the period June, 2025 to June 30th, 2028, for the purchase of 6-12 grades Designated English Language Development 1-4.

Passed by the following vote:

PREFERENTIAL AYE:

PREFERENTIAL NOE:

PREFERENTIAL ABSTENTION:

PREFERENTIAL RECUSE:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSTAINED:

RECUSE:

ABSENT:

Legislative File Info.	
File ID Number:	25-0711
Introduction Date:	
Enactment Number:	
Enactment Date:	

CERTIFICATION

We hereby certify that the foregoing is a full, true and correct copy of a Resolution passed at a Regular Meeting of the Board of Education of the Oakland Unified School District, held on April 23, 2025.

OAKLAND UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT

Jennifer Brouhard
President, Board of Education

Kyla Johnson-Trammell
Secretary, Board of Education

Attachment A:

Designated English Language Development (D-ELD) Levels 1-4 Proposal

Table of Contents

[I. Purpose of Document](#)

[II. Summary of Strengths and Needed Improvements](#)

[III. Findings by Activity or Data Source](#)

A. [Participating Teacher Feedback](#)

B. [Lesson Observations](#)

C. [Student Work Samples](#)

[IV. Links and References](#)

I. Purpose of Pilot and Document

Newcomer ELD teachers across OUSD have been using the *National Geographic* curriculum, which has been the *Inside* textbooks for middle school and the *Edge* textbooks for middle school. However, these textbooks are being discontinued and are no longer being printed, and will no longer be available to order in the next few years. For this reason, the ELLMA Office decided to investigate other curriculum options for secondary newcomer ELD, in addition to the new textbooks from *National Geographic*. After surveying neighboring and similar districts who serve similar populations of newcomers, ELLMA learned that the *Vista* curriculum is another popular choice and warranted further investigation. For this reason, we landed on piloting the new curriculum in *National Geographic (Lift)* along with *Vista*. Interested teachers were recruited to participate in the pilot and attended appropriate trainings to get started using the pilot curriculum.

This report was prepared by the ELLMA Secondary Newcomer Team and brings together the many pieces of information the Team collected about *Vista (Get Ready, Engage, and Bridges)* textbooks and the new *National Geographic* curriculum (*Lift* textbooks) during the 2024-25 school year (concentrated in the months of November to March).

The report begins with a focused summary of strengths and areas of improvement for the curriculum piloted. The report then follows with our findings from teacher feedback, lesson observations, and student work samples. In total, there were 9 participating teachers across 5 schools (both middle and high school) in this pilot during the 2024-2025 school year. The participating teachers were chosen to represent a mix of new teachers (including first year), experienced teachers (5-10 years experience), and veteran teachers (15-20 years experience). Teachers were also recruited and chosen to participate based on their appetite and willingness for this project, including openness to lesson observations and ability to provide detailed and thoughtful feedback.

This report represents the recommendations of the ELLMA Newcomer Team and the participating teachers in the curriculum pilot. The goal of the report is to support a curriculum adoption for Newcomer ELD at the secondary level, which is a course sequence during the first three years of U.S. schools for newcomers in grades 6-12. After completing the course sequence ELD 1, ELD 2, and ELD 3, students are no longer considered newcomers and will be entering non-

newcomer ELD courses. Again, this curriculum pilot focused on supporting the newcomer ELD sequence with a recommendation for appropriate materials.

II. Summary of Strengths and Needed Improvements

Below is a high level summary of the strengths and needed improvements for each program based on our data sources. We begin with an outline of which textbooks would align to each newcomer ELD level (levels 1-3).

ELD Level	National Geographic Textbook	Vista Textbook
ELD 1	Lift Welcome	Get Ready 6-8 and 9-12
ELD 2	Lift Intro	Get Ready 6-8 and 9-12
ELD 3	Lift Fundamentals	Engage A (HS) Bridges A (MS)
ELD 4	Lift 1	Engage B (HS) Bridges B (MS)

Program Element	Vista (Get Ready and Bridges/Engage)	National Geographic (Lift)	Which program is stronger?
Overview/ Comparison	The Vista curriculum begins with the book <i>Get Ready</i> which has two versions: one for grades 6-8 and one for grades 9-12. <i>Get Ready</i> has 10 units which could be spread over the first two ELD levels: ELD 1 and ELD 2. Here is a link to the Get Ready 6-8 scope and sequence . The units cover typical beginning ELD topics such as introductions, talking about the classroom, etc. Vista then moves to <i>Engage</i> (for high school) and <i>Bridges</i> (for middle school) which is organized by an essential question and has a series of texts and activities organized around the essential question and theme, such as “choices and pathways” (unit 1) and “hope and courage (unit 2). For Vista, OUSD would purchase separate books for middle school and high school.	The <i>National Geographic</i> series is the same for grades 6-12 (i.e. no separate high school and middle school textbooks). The textbook is called <i>Lift</i> and is separated into levels: welcome (ELD 1), intro (ELD 2), fundamentals (ELD 3). The <i>Lift Welcome</i> textbook is similar to the <i>Get Ready</i> book by Vista in that it begins with similar topics like introductions, classroom vocabulary, etc. It is still organized by an essential question; for example, the first unit question is “Who are you?” The next textbook, <i>Lift Intro</i> , has slightly more sophisticated essential questions and more complex text than the second half of the <i>Get Ready</i> textbook.	National Geographic. National Geographic has a more rigorous ELD 2 book, with more complex text, but then a less rigorous jump to ELD 3. Vista allows for students to work on basic English for longer in ELD 2 by using the <i>Get Ready</i> book for both ELD 1 and ELD 2. However, once students are in ELD 3, the jump to <i>Bridges/Engage</i> is quite steep as the A, B, C levels are not differentiated (i.e. A is not easier than B in terms of text complexity).

Extended student inquiry on a topic to build knowledge and language learning in preparation for a summative task	Get Ready (for ELD 1-2) has 10 units plus a lot of supplementary materials that can span across ELD 1 and 2. For ELD 3 the jump is to Bridges or Engage Level A. The units are organized around themes and essential questions; however there is not a strong text set to go with each topic/theme. Additionally, the end of unit tasks are not explicitly tied to a mentor text that is part of a unit, so teachers would need to improvise and create their own text-based tasks as end of unit summative tasks.	The Lift textbooks for ELD 1-3 are titled Welcome, Intro, and Fundamentals. Welcome has 12 units and Intro and Fundamentals have 8 units. Each unit is organized around a theme and essential question and tied together with texts related to the theme. There are several texts in each unit and a summative task that is related to the texts in the unit, and connected to the essential question and key language/vocabulary in the unit.	National Geographic (Lift) , due to multiple texts in each unit to support genuine inquiry and language development that culminate in a summative task. Also, there are easier-to-follow writing genre development tied to the unit summative task.
Rigor and engagement of texts and tasks	<i>Get Ready</i> has some texts appropriate for ELD 1 but because the book would be used for both ELD 1 and ELD 2, it is lacking in rigorous text appropriate for ELD 2. And then for ELD 3 the Bridges/Engage A texts jump to a much higher complexity.	<i>Lift</i> texts are rigorous and engaging, tasks are grade-level aligned in terms of standards, and the inclusion of open-ended tasks and a more authentic, extended inquiry supports critical thinking, language learning and quality student production.	National Geographic (Lift) , due to the sophistication of thinking and student production due to longer units and genuine inquiry.
Scaffolding up to complex text and task for all students	There is appropriate scaffolding at the <i>Get Ready</i> level textbooks, however when students get to ELD 3 and to the Bridges/Engage Level A textbooks, there is not sufficient scaffolding. It is a huge leap at that level and teachers will need to do their own scaffolding of the texts in order to create access points.	There is appropriate scaffolding of texts in the <i>Lift</i> textbooks with a predictable before, during, after reading sequence of strategies. Students are given opportunities to engage with the language and content of the texts in this lesson framework and through the key strategies.	National Geographic (Lift) , due to the extended inquiry that supports student acquisition of language, literacy and content over time.
Teacher Useability	<i>Vista</i> has a lot of resources for teachers to use, and a lot of guidance and support, although it takes time to learn about all the different resources available and how they can be used. For a new teacher, it will take training and support to make use of these materials. .	Teachers in our feedback session noted that the <i>National Geographic</i> textbooks are easy to follow and fairly self-explanatory. There are other resources that go along with the textbooks (mostly online) and they are easy to use and follow.	National Geographic (Lift) because it has fewer components and is easier to follow, especially for a new teacher.
Teacher Craft and Professional	The wealth of resources is impressive, but to make good use of the multiplicity of resources, some	Overall, the clear and appropriate complex essential questions and student inquiry guidance create a	National Geographic because of the stronger framing of a

Agency	type of organizing principle not explicitly articulated in the program—seems necessary. For new teachers especially, there is a lot to sift through and a need to create additional scaffolds. .	guiding principle that is both reflected in the details of the lesson and available to help teachers make specific decisions about how to deliver a lesson, or help teachers and sites choose a focus to go deeper. These principles set a course for teachers to grow as individuals and as a community.	complex essential question that organizes the materials and practices (including inquiry projects), which can guide further teacher learning over time.
Equity and Cultural Responsiveness	The texts in <i>Vista</i> are culturally responsive and have engaging themes related to many students' lived experiences.	<i>National Geographic</i> has a variety of texts, some of which feel connected to students' experiences, and all of which have themes that students will find relatable.	<i>National Geographic</i> , for the extended inquiry work that invites deeper student investment and their longer-standing engagement with a complex, but relatable theme.
Student Talk and Integrated ELD	There are opportunities for student talk however those opportunities often require teachers to create additional scaffolds for access points the curriculum doesn't provide.	There is a clear before, during, after sequence of strategies to support student talk around a text, theme, and essential question.	<i>National Geographic</i> , for the much stronger framing around student talk related to complex texts and tasks.
Designated ELD	There is explicit attention to teaching Part II of the CA ELD standards, however teachers mentioned that the language focus parts of the lessons are sometimes not tied to the texts and themes.	There is also explicit teaching of Part II of the CA ELD standards in this curriculum with more attention tying the language components to the texts and themes of the unit. There is also a Language Companion piece that a piloting teacher appreciated.	<i>National Geographic</i> for its attention to tying the language focus of each unit and lesson to the text and task.

III. Findings by Activity or Data Source

In this section we describe the different data gathering activities, and discuss what trends are appearing by activity or data source, and provide links to the sources documents.

A. Participating Teacher Feedback

The following teachers participated in the textbook pilot during this 2024-25 school year. Teachers attended textbook training in August-September 2024, and then received class sets of textbooks and online access to the program to implement in their classrooms. Teachers gave feedback through surveys in October-November 2024. In the spring semester, teachers gave feedback during Second Wednesday PD in January and during a release day in February.

Table: Teachers Participating in Pilot

Teacher Name	School Site	Grade Level	Curriculum Piloting
Elsa Varela	Frick United	6-8	Get Ready, Bridges A
Haylin Mujica-Herrera	Frick United	6-8	Get Ready
Amanda Bloch	Greenleaf	6-8	Get Ready
Nelly Alcantar	Melrose Leadership Academy	6-8	Get Ready
Alicia Lobaco	Fremont High School	9-12	Engage B (ELD 4)
Laura Robinson	Fremont High School	9-12	Engage B (ELD 4)
Javier Alvarado	Fremont High School	9-12	Engage B (ELD 5)
Sara Delman	Fremont High School	9-12	Engage A (ELD 3)
Joel Tomfohr	Fremont High School	9-12	Get Ready (ELD 2)
Peter Cook	Castlemont High School	9-12	Get Ready (ELD 1)
Diana Campos & Curt Douglas (coach)	Elmhurst United	6-8	Lift Welcome, Intro, Fundamentals, Level 1
Shannon Darcey	Urban Promise Academy	6-8	Lift Welcome and Intro

Table: Feedback Opportunities

Program & notes link	Date	Artifact	Grades Represented	# of Attendees	Sites represented
Teacher Survey Data	12.9.24	First Survey Responses Link	6-12	7	Frick MLA Fremont Elmhurst
Teacher Focus Group Release Day	2.27.25	Survey Responses Link Release day agenda	6-12	9	Frick Fremont Elmhurst UPA

Key Learnings from Survey Data and Feedback Opportunities

We collected feedback in December, after teachers had been using the pilot materials for a couple months, and then again in February, after teachers had been piloting the materials for four months or more. The first round of feedback

was based on survey data only, and the second round was during a release day where we had extended conversations about the materials, compared similar units across the two textbooks, and looked at student work. We also collected robust feedback via survey at the end of the release day together.

Highlights of Complex Text and Task Answers

Teachers noted that both curriculum include complex texts and various access points to complex text. Teachers found the Vista texts to be too complex at the Engage/Bridges level for newcomers students to access without significant scaffolding on the part of the teacher. National Geographic, on the other hand, provided complex texts that were shorter and more accessible, yet still complex and robust.

Highlights of Teacher Experience and Usability Answers

All teachers reported that the National Geographic program was more user-friendly especially for new teachers, and the Vista curriculum contained so many resources it felt overwhelming. One new teacher reported, “the usability of the Lift textbooks is simply easier for me to start with. As overwhelming as it is to be a teacher, the Lift text book allows me to backwards plan my lesson in a clear way. I am able to almost teach out of the book with the way that the lessons easily flow into one another. The structure of Vista lessons were confusing to plan and since they jumped around a lot, objectives were hard to follow and communicate to kids.” This summarizes how the teachers overall felt about the usability.

Highlights of Student Experience Answers (Extended Inquiry Around a Topic)

Generally both programs but especially National Geographic earned strong praise for its ability to engage students in inquiry study of interesting topics, and support them in sophisticated writing and rich and authentic conversation. One teacher said, “The theme and connection between texts in each unit in the Nat Geo curriculum seems very clear and would provide a coherent framework for students, but that while the text is engaging in Vista, the theme and connection among texts within a unit is much less apparent.” Overall teachers felt the National Geographic curriculum was stronger.

C. Lesson Observations

We conducted 5 lesson observations (2 for *Lift- National Geographic* and 3 for *Vista*). The purpose of the lesson observations was to get a deeper understanding of how the curriculum worked and what it offered. The observers included a Central Office TSA in the ELLMA Office and 1 site-based language and literacy coach. The two observers met to debrief and come to consensus on key noticings from lesson observations including comparisons between the two curriculum by analyzing similar units and noting key differences.

The goal during the debrief was to dig further into the lesson materials in relation to what had just been seen in order to assess the program on the rubric indicators, with evidence included along with our ratings. [The lesson observation documentation for both programs is viewable here.](#)

Overall, the National Geographic (Lift) observations and materials were rated between 3-4 and the Vista observations were rated between 2-3, giving the National Geographic lesson observations an overall higher average score.

Highlights of the National Geographic (Lift) Lesson Observations

National Geographic (Lift) showed its greatest strength in providing opportunities for students to access appropriately leveled complex text sets around an engaging theme. Lessons were anchored in complex text and provided rigor and scaffolds and useful lesson routines across the unit with all of these ratings at 3 - strong or above when the observers ratings are averaged. This textbook series is overall significantly stronger than *Vista* for all indicators.

Highlights of the Vista Lesson Observations

Vista's strengths, at the *Get Ready* level, are in supporting students to access themes related to their everyday lives, like understanding fire drills and the language around that topic, as well as identifying aches and pains in the body and be able to talk about that. At the *Get Ready* level especially, though, there is less of focus on a complex and rigorous essential question tied to complex text sets with before, during, and after reading routines, which is present in the *National Geographic* curriculum.

D. Student Work Samples

The Student work samples provided a window into the types of assignments that students were asked to complete in the two programs. [You can see the student work sample from an ELD 1 classroom piloting Lift here.](#)

The [student work from an ELD 3 class using Vista is here](#), however it is with a teacher-created scaffold the textbook did not provide, which is typical of the writing and reading experiences teachers had with this curriculum.

IV. Links and References

A. Explanation of Program Elements in the Summary of Strengths and Needed Improvements

Below we provide brief definitions of each of the areas called out in the table summarizing strengths and needed areas for improvement.

- **Extended student inquiry on a topic to build knowledge and language learning in preparation for a summative task:** This element evaluates the ability of the curriculum to create sustained student inquiry around a topic over time, so that students may build both content and language knowledge, including understanding of specific genres that are called for in a summative task.
- **Rigor and engagement of texts and tasks:** This element refers to the programs adherence to grade-level standards and challenge in texts and tasks, but also to how engaging the tasks are, since if texts and tasks are not engaging, then students will be less likely to engage in the productive struggle that allows them to master grade level content. A critical aspect of engaging tasks is cultural responsiveness (see below).
- **Scaffolding up to complex text and tasks for all students:** The benefits of work with complex texts must be available to ALL students daily, including historically underserved students such as including historically underserved students such as African American, Latino, and Pacific Islander students, ELLs and students with IEPs. We must “scaffold up” to complex text, rather than simplify or circumvent the text. Using strategies such as pairing students with different language abilities, providing frequent opportunities for student talk and sense making supported by protocols and/or language patterns. By providing templates for responding to a piece of text, planning to write, and using visuals to illustrate concepts.
- **Teacher Useability:** This element is focused on how well the program provides routines and rhythms that help teachers in understanding and preparing to teach, and how well the program integrates all those elements that are needed to fully serve OUSD students, such as strong student talk guidance and robust scaffolding opportunities
- **Teacher Craft and Professional Agency:** This element refers to the ability of the program to go beyond scripting of lessons to the building of solid foundational knowledge in key areas (e.g. scaffolding) that will support teachers

with decision making and deepening of implementation of a curriculum over time. It also includes opportunities for teachers to innovate within the curriculum. This foundational knowledge should also appear as advice to teachers in lessons around specific areas (again, scaffolding is a good example) so that teachers can make instructional decisions tailored to their students.

- **Equity and Cultural Responsiveness:** This is a complex element with many facets. First, text topics, characters and authors of texts should provide robust representation from historically underrepresented groups, such as lower income people, women, LGBTQ people, African Americans, Asians and Pacific Islanders, Native Americans, Latinos, and English Language Learners. Second, the practices and the tasks in the lessons should promote equity and reflect cultural diversity. For example, curriculums are more culturally responsive and equitable when they are structured to provide opportunities for student discussion, particularly when the prompts are open ended and students have a role in running the discussions. These discussions allow students to bring their own culture into the learning space. Thirdly, a curriculum should provide implementers with a clear and explicit guidance about how to provide all students equitable access.
- **Student Talk and Integrated ELD:** Integrated ELD is the practice of explicitly teaching language all day long in every content area. Sample practices that help students develop academic language include opportunities for students to talk about and make meaning of academic texts and content (including *student-to-student* talk), providing graphic organizers and teaching academic vocabulary through multiple examples. Robust opportunities for students to talk, including authentic dialogue around engaging and open-ended questions are associated with strong student literacy outcomes.
- **Designated ELD:** The Designated ELD described in the CA ELA/ELD Framework avoids isolated grammar exercises designed to identify and correct language “deficits.” Instead, it focuses on students “interacting in meaningful ways,” as they “learn about how English works.” These Designated ELD lessons leverage students’ ability to discuss and write about how specific language holds meaning in texts, and then apply this knowledge to writing and speech opportunities that matter to students.

B. Summaries of Rubric Indicators

[Pilot Lesson Observation Indicators Summary](#)